



HIGH COURT OF AUSTRALIA

NOTICE OF FILING

This document was filed electronically in the High Court of Australia on 17 Jun 2021 and has been accepted for filing under the *High Court Rules 2004*. Details of filing and important additional information are provided below.

Details of Filing

File Number: B52/2020
File Title: Palmer v. The State of Western Australia
Registry: Brisbane
Document filed: Form 27F - Outline of oral argument
Filing party: Interveners
Date filed: 17 Jun 2021

Important Information

This Notice has been inserted as the cover page of the document which has been accepted for filing electronically. It is now taken to be part of that document for the purposes of the proceeding in the Court and contains important information for all parties to that proceeding. It must be included in the document served on each of those parties and whenever the document is reproduced for use by the Court.

IN THE HIGH COURT OF AUSTRALIA
BRISBANE REGISTRY

No. **B52 of 2020**

BETWEEN:

CLIVE FREDERICK PALMER
Plaintiff

and

10

STATE OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA
Defendant

IN THE HIGH COURT OF AUSTRALIA
BRISBANE REGISTRY

No. **B54 of 2020**

BETWEEN:

MINERALOGY PTY LTD (ACN 010 582 680)
First Plaintiff

and

20

INTERNATIONAL MINERALS PTY LTD (ACN 058 341 638)
Second Plaintiff

and

30

STATE OF WESTERN AUSTRALIA
Defendant

**OUTLINE OF ORAL SUBMISSIONS
ATTORNEY-GENERAL FOR THE STATE OF QUEENSLAND**

40

Filed on behalf of the Attorney-General for
the State of Queensland (Intervening)

17 June 2021

Document No: 11852584

PART I: Internet publication

1. This outline of oral submissions is in a form suitable for publication on the Internet.

PART II: Outline

Severance

- 10 2. Queensland relies on its written submissions, save that Queensland now adopts the Commonwealth's submissions as to which provisions are determinative.

Manner and form

3. Assuming cl 32 is engaged, Queensland makes three points on the manner and form question.
- 20 (a) *First*, cl 32 does not have the force of 'a law made...by the Parliament' as prescribed by s 6 of the *Australia Act 1986* (Cth) (**QS [45] adopting B52DS [94]-[96]**).
- (b) *Second*, in the alternative, if cl 32 is construed to remove Parliament's power to amend the agreement unilaterally (which it should not be: **cf QS[48]**), it is not a 'manner and form' provision because it impermissibly purports to prohibit Parliament from legislating on the subject matter of variation of the Agreement in 'any manner and form' (*Attorney-General (NSW) v Trethowan* (1931) 44 CLR 394, 419 (Rich J), 431 (Dixon J), 443 (McTiernan J) [**JBA 2.39.667;679;691**]; *Commonwealth Aluminium Corporation Ltd v Attorney-General* [1976] Qd R 231, 237 (Wanstall J) [**JBA 19.126.7770**]; see also *West Lakes v South Australia* (1980) 25 SASR 389 at 398 (King J).
- 30 (c) *Third*, 'the operation that [the *Australia Act 1986* (Cth)] is to be given as a law of the Commonwealth in relation to State law [is] by s 109 of the Constitution': *Attorney-General (WA) v Marquet* (2003) 217 CLR 545, 570-1 [67] (Gleeson CJ, Gummow, Hayne and Heydon JJ) [**JBA 2.41.761,787**].
- 40 - An analysis of the 'extent of the inconsistency' for the purposes of s 109 begins with the proper construction of the Commonwealth Act, and, here, the meaning of 'a law made ... by the Parliament of a State' in s 6.

- Another construction of ‘law’ for s 6 of the *Australia Act 1986* (Cth) is that it does not necessarily refer to a statute ‘taken as a unit’. A ‘law’ is not the instrument, but the ‘rule’ resolved upon and adopted by the legislative organ.
- cf *Momcilovic v The Queen* (2011) 245 CLR 1, 106 [226]-[228] (Gummow J) [**JBA 11.86.4633**]
- It is only a ‘law’, as so understood, which s 6 of the *Australia Act* provides ‘shall be of no force or effect’ if enacted in non-compliance with a valid and applicable manner and form provision

10

Section 118

4. Queensland adopts the submissions of the defendant that prior to a positive act of recognising an award, ss 35 and 36 of the CAAs have no operation.

20

- cf *TCL Air Conditioner v Federal Court* (2013) 251 CLR 533 [22]-[23] [**JBA 16.110.6630-1**]

5. In the alternative, Queensland supplements its written submissions (**QS [50]-[60]**) in the following respects. The Amendment Act has the effect that the first and second awards are not ‘arbitral awards’ for the purposes of s 35 of the *Commercial Arbitration Act* of any jurisdiction. (**QS [54]-[58]**).

30

- (a) Section 35 of each CAA applies only to an ‘arbitral award’.
- (b) The CAA (WA) made the first and second awards, ‘arbitral awards’ for the purposes of s 35 of the CAA of each jurisdiction.
- (c) That is made explicit by s 31, which stipulates the form and content requirements of an award. Section 31 of the CAA (WA) applies only if the place of the arbitration is Western Australia (s 1(2)).
- (d) Having given the awards the status of an ‘arbitral award’ for the purposes of s 35, the Western Australian Parliament can take away that status. That is the effect of sections 10(4) and (6) of the Amendment Act.

40

- (e) There is therefore no inconsistency between the Amendment Act, and s 35 of the CAAs of other jurisdictions. Nor can it be said that the Amendment Act fails to give ‘full faith and credit’ to s 35 of the laws.
- (f) The point is conceptually no different from the operation of s 34 and a 34A of the CAA (WA) (which also only apply if the place of the arbitration is Western Australia – s 1(2)). These laws similarly remove the status of an award as an ‘arbitral award’ for the purposes of s 35.
- (g) For that reason, if ss 10(4) and (6) are valid, there can never be ‘enforcement’ of the awards under s 36 of any CAA, because they are not ‘arbitral awards’ for the purposes of that section.
- (h) Were ss 10(4) and (6) invalid, then ss 10(5) and (7) would make the arbitration agreements ‘not valid under the law to which the parties have subjected it’ for the purposes of s 36(1)(a).

Dated: 17 June 2021.

.....
 Erin Longbottom QC
 Telephone: 07 3012 8221
 Facsimile: 07 3175 4666
elongbottom@qldbar.asn.au

.....
 Felicity Nagorcka
 Counsel for the Attorney-
 General for Queensland
 Telephone: 07 3031 5616
 Facsimile: 07 3031 5605
felicity.nagorcka@crownlaw.qld.gov.au